STAFF REPORT – COALINGA-HURON LIBRARY DISTRICT

Subject: Phone System Upgrade
Meeting Date: Tuesday, July 28, 2026
From: Jeannette Davies, Library Director
Prepared by: Nathan Vosburg, Information Technology Analyst

I. RECOMMENDATION:

Review the proposed telephone system replacement options presented by C.A. Redding and AMS and provide direction to staff regarding the preferred vendor and authorization to proceed with implementation.

II. BACKGROUND:

The Coalinga-Huron Library District's existing telephone system has reached the end of its useful life and is no longer supported by the manufacturer.
The current **Coalinga** facility utilizes:

- 1 fax line
- 2 voice telephone lines
- 10 NEC desktop telephones
- NEC PBX telephone system (installed during the 2014-2015 fiscal year)
- Amplified public address (PA) system
- External cooling fan mounted on the PBX equipment

The existing PBX provides:

- Voicemail
- Extension dialing
- Auto Attendant
- Holiday scheduling
- Opening and closing recordings
- All-page intercom functionality

Each telephone is connected through Category 5/6 cabling to a patch panel, which terminates into the PBX located within the communications equipment room.
The **Huron Branch** currently operates with:

- 1 telephone line
- 2 wireless telephones

Unlike Coalinga, Huron does not currently have an integrated telephone system and operates independently.

Because the existing NEC system is end-of-life, replacement parts and manufacturer support have become increasingly limited, creating operational risk should a hardware failure occur. The system has no updates available, and routinely fails to register holiday times correctly causing the phone system to not work during certain open hours.

III. PROPOSED PROJECT:

Staff has solicited proposals to replace the existing PBX with a modern cloud-based Voice over Internet Protocol (VoIP) telephone system.

The objectives of the project are to:
- Replace the unsupported NEC PBX.
- Standardize communications between the Coalinga and Huron branches.
- Link both library locations into one unified telephone system.
- Expand phone coverage where operational needs exist.
- Improve system reliability and disaster recovery.
- Reduce dependence on aging on-site telephone equipment.
- Provide a platform capable of future growth.

The proposed systems increase the total number of telephones by adding:
- One additional phone for each of the Board Rooms.
- Two additional telephones in the Coalinga Technology Room.
- One additional telephone at the Huron Branch.

IV. VENDOR PROPSALS:

Staff received proposals from:
- C.A. Redding
- AMS

Representatives from AMS and C.A. Redding will attend the Board meeting (either in person or remotely via Zoom) to present their proposals and answer questions.

V. CA REDDING PROPOSAL

C.A. Redding submitted two separate proposals, both utilizing an Internet-based cloud VoIP platform. Both proposals include installation, migration from the existing PBX, and the expanded phone deployment described above.

Option 1 – Lower Upfront Equipment Cost / Higher Monthly Service

This option minimizes initial capital costs by leasing much of the equipment through the monthly service.
Estimated costs include:

- One-Time Costs: **$2,287.99**
- Monthly Service: **$399.23**

Included features include:

- Cloud PBX
- Unlimited local and long-distance calling
- Auto Attendant
- Voicemail
- SMS/MMS texting
- Mobile and desktop applications
- Microsoft Teams integration
- Advanced Hunt Groups
- Call Queues
- AI Assistant
- 30-day communications archiving
- On-site installation

Option 2 – Higher Upfront Equipment Purchase / Lower Monthly Service
This option purchases most telephone hardware up front, reducing recurring monthly costs.
Estimated costs include:

- One-Time Costs: **$4,645.69**
- Monthly Service: **$278.61**

The system includes the same cloud PBX features while purchasing most of the telephone hardware rather than amortizing it into the monthly service.

System Benefits
Regardless of the option selected, the proposed cloud-based telephone system offers several operational improvements over the current system, including:

- Elimination of the aging on-site PBX hardware.
- Unified communications between Coalinga and Huron.
- Cloud-based administration.
- Remote management capabilities.
- Mobile and desktop phone applications.
- Business SMS texting.
- Improved call routing.
- Auto attendant and holiday scheduling.

- Advanced call queue capabilities.
- Easier expansion for future staffing needs.
- Improved disaster recovery, allowing calls to continue routing even if a physical office becomes unavailable.
- Integration with Microsoft Teams (depending on licensing option selected).

VI. AMS/MGT PROPOSAL

1. FortiVoice (On-Premises PBX Solution)
The FortiVoice proposal replaces the existing NEC PBX with a new on-site Fortinet phone system. The proposal includes redundant FortiVoice controllers, new FortiFone desktop and wireless telephones, three years of FortiCare Premium Support, professional installation, system configuration, and project management. The FortiVoice solution retains an on-premises PBX architecture while modernizing the District's communications infrastructure. The quoted cost for the initial three-year deployment is **$23,813.72**.

2. Zoom Phone (Cloud-Based VoIP Solution)
The Zoom Phone proposal replaces the existing PBX with a cloud-hosted Voice over Internet Protocol (VoIP) solution. The proposal includes 19 Zoom Phone Pro licenses, three unlimited U.S./Canada calling licenses, Pay-As-You-Go calling for remaining users, professional implementation services, and separate hardware for desk phones. The Zoom solution provides standard business phone features including voicemail, auto attendant, call routing, call queues, call transfer, mobile and desktop applications, remote administration, and cloud-based management without maintaining on-site PBX hardware. The initial three-year prepaid proposal totals **$14,439.00**, including **$6,511.08** in one-time implementation costs and an estimated subscription cost of **$220.22 per month**.

Long-Term Cost Comparison

AMS/MGT also provided an estimated **10-Year Total Cost of Ownership (TCO)** comparison for both solutions. Based on their estimates, the FortiVoice on-premises solution has a projected 10-year cost of approximately **$32,014.62**, while the Zoom Phone cloud solution is projected at approximately **$22,312.64** over the same period. These estimates include the initial purchase as well as projected support and subscription costs. Staff notes that these figures are vendor-provided estimates intended for comparison purposes.

VII. STAFF ANALYSIS

The District's current PBX system is approximately 11–12 years old and has exceeded its expected service life. Continued reliance on unsupported hardware increases the risk of service interruptions and makes future repairs more difficult due to limited parts availability.
Migrating to a cloud-hosted VoIP solution would modernize the District's telecommunications infrastructure while providing enhanced functionality, simplified management, improved resiliency, and the ability to seamlessly connect both library branches under a single unified phone system.

Overall, the two vendors are offering different philosophies rather than directly equivalent products.

Feature	C.A. Redding	AMS/MGT
Primary Solution	Cloud VoIP (Intermedia)	Cloud VoIP (Zoom) or On-Premises PBX (FortiVoice)
Deployment Options	2 cloud options	1 cloud + 1 on-premises option
Hardware	Yealink IP Phones	Yealink (Zoom) or FortiFone (FortiVoice)
Supports Coalinga & Huron Together	Yes	Yes
Mobile/Desktop Apps	Yes	Yes (Zoom)
Auto Attendant / Voicemail / Extensions	Yes	Yes
Call Queues / Hunt Groups	Included	Included (Zoom)
Business SMS	Included	Not specifically included in proposal
Microsoft Teams Integration	Native Teams integration	No (Zoom ecosystem)
AI Features	AI Assistant included	Standard Zoom Phone features
On-Premises Hardware Required	No	Only with FortiVoice
Vendor Presentation	Yes	Yes

Cost Comparison

Vendor	Option	Upfront Cost	Monthly Cost
C.A. Redding	Option 1	$2,287.99	$399.23
C.A. Redding	Option 2	$4,645.69	$278.61
AMS/MGT	Zoom Phone	$6,511.08	≈$220.22 (3-year prepaid equivalent)
AMS/MGT	FortiVoice PBX	$23,813.72	No recurring subscription beyond support renewals

Long-Term Cost
The one place AMS/MGT distinguishes itself is by providing a 10-Year Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) comparison:

- FortiVoice (On-Premises): $32,014.62
- Zoom Phone (Cloud): $22,312.64

C.A. Redding did not provide a comparable long-term TCO analysis, so a direct 10-year comparison between vendors cannot be made from the proposals alone

From a high level:

- C.A. Redding offers the lowest upfront investment, particularly with Option 1, and includes robust cloud PBX features, Microsoft Teams integration, SMS messaging, AI capabilities, and unified communications.
- AMS/MGT Zoom Phone has the highest initial cost of the cloud solutions but the lowest recurring monthly service, making it potentially attractive from a long-term operational budgeting perspective.
- AMS/MGT FortiVoice is the only proposal that maintains a traditional on-premises PBX, requiring the largest capital investment while minimizing dependence on cloud services.

For the Board, the decision largely comes down to three considerations:

1. Cloud vs. On-Premises – Whether the District prefers a fully cloud-managed phone system or wishes to continue owning and maintaining an on-site PBX.
2. Capital vs. Operating Costs – Whether to minimize the initial investment or reduce ongoing monthly expenses.
3. Desired Features – C.A. Redding emphasizes Microsoft Teams integration and business messaging, while AMS/MGT's Zoom Phone proposal

emphasizes the Zoom communications ecosystem and lower long-term subscription costs.

VIII. RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends considering both the long-term operational costs and available capital funding when evaluating the proposals.

IX. ALTERNATIVES:

Do not accept any of the quotes, (not recommended).
Have staff continue to search for other phone options.

X. FISCAL IMPACT

The proposed telephone system replacement will require both a one-time capital investment and ongoing operating costs, depending on the solution selected. Staff received proposals from **C.A. Redding** and **AMS/MGT**, offering both cloud-based Voice over Internet Protocol (VoIP) solutions and a traditional on-premises PBX solution.

Vendor	Solution	One-Time Cost	Monthly Cost
C.A. Redding	Cloud VoIP – Lower Upfront / Higher Monthly	$2,287.99	$399.23
C.A. Redding	Cloud VoIP – Higher Upfront / Lower Monthly	$4,645.69	$278.61
AMS/MGT	Zoom Phone Cloud VoIP	$6,511.08	$220.22 *(estimated)*
AMS/MGT	FortiVoice On-Premises PBX	$23,813.72	Support renewals after initial 3-year term

In addition to the initial costs, AMS/MGT provided an estimated 10-year Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) comparison for its two proposed solutions:

AMS/MGT Solution	Estimated 10-Year TCO
Zoom Phone Cloud VoIP	$22,312.64
FortiVoice On-Premises PBX	$32,014.62

The Board may consider several factors when evaluating the proposals, including the balance between upfront capital investment and ongoing operating expenses, the benefits of a cloud-based versus on-premises telephone system, long-term ownership costs, and the communication features offered by each solution. Funding for the selected proposal will be provided through the appropriate budgeted technology or capital improvement account, subject to Board approval

ATTACHMENTS:

- C.A. Redding Proposal – Option 1 (Lower Upfront Cost / Higher Monthly Service).
- C.A. Redding Proposal – Option 2 (Higher Upfront Cost / Lower Monthly Service).
- AMS/MGT - Quote Q-00104155 for Coalinga Huron - FortiVoice 3YPP
- AMS/MGT - Quote Q-00104155 for Coalinga Huron - Phones for Zoom Phone
- AMS/MGT – SaaS Q-00104157 for Coalinga Huron Zoom Phone 3YPP